

Dear Rubina,

I confess I am a bit confused by the whole situation around our article aa53206-24 dealing with the Hvar UBV photometry. Before proceeding any further, we would like to clarify with you the position of the editors on the whole problem.

At the end of this email I am reproducing some relevant correspondence with Dr. Forveille and with you.

As you can see, Dr. Forveille was not willing to consider our paper unless we would publish the whole archives already with paper I (we indicated in the originally submitted version that we *i n t e n d* to do so, but with a delay, after finishing a few dedicated studies and submitting paper II on other types of variable observed at Hvar.

After this, we capitulated and agreed to publish the archives immediately after the paper is accepted for publication.

After receiving the first referee report by Dr. Baade, we accepted another recommendation by Dr. Forveille and moved large parts of the paper including tables with the improved UBV values of all our standards (comparison, check etc.) into appendices, indicating that all appendices will be moved to ZENODO after the acceptance of the paper.

However, such an approach is now criticised by Dr. Baade. He (only now) also objects against the use of colours in the diagrams and the discussions of less frequently observed stars in an appendix.

All this is quite surprising to us since the very same Dr. Baade is one of the active co-authors of the large paper by Labadie-Bartz et al., which was published this year in A&A, see <https://www.aanda.org/articles/aa/pdf/2025/07/aa53321-24.pdf>

Note that the authors of that paper

1. Did not publish the EW measurements, which they analyse for periodicity, in a tabular form - in contradiction to the policy communicated to us by dr. Forveille;
2. use colours quite heavily in their diagrams, and
3. put discussions of all less observed stars into Appendix.

We would, therefore, very appreciate your comments and advice what the editors suggest to us.

With my best regards,

Petr

From editorial.office@aanda.org Sat Nov 30 09:51:13 2024
Date: Sat, 30 Nov 2024 10:51:03 +0100
From: "Astronomy and Astrophysics (A&A)" <editorial.office@aanda.org>
To: petr.harmanec@matfyz.cuni.cz
Subject: aa53206-24: Data policy
Resent-From: <petr.harmanec@matfyz.cuni.cz>

Article reference: aa53206-24

Title: Half a century of UBV photometry at Hvar I. Overview and emission-line stars

Author(s): H. Božić , P. Harmanec, J. Horn, K. Juza, P. Koubský, S. Kříž, P. Mayer, P. Hadrava, D. Ruždjak, D. Sudar, S. Štefl , M. Wolf, P. Zasche, M. Brož , J. Havelka, J. Honsa, V. Kocourek, M. Tlamicha, F. Žďárský, A. Harmanec, J. Jonák, A. Oplištilová, I. Piantschitsch, I. Skokić, J. , Švrčková, K. Vitovský, D. Vršnak , M. Zummer

Dear Prof. Harmanec,

A&A authors are required to publish the data that are presented and discussed in articles and needed to reproduce the results. Archiving the data also increases the value of the article, and thus its impact in the community. Publication of the data, usually at the CDS, should occur immediately upon acceptance of the article. Some common examples of data that must be archived are measurements of radial velocities that led to the detection of planetary or stellar companions to stars and photometric data used in asteroseismologic studies. By data, we mean not only primary observational material, but also tools of general interest such as catalogs or theoretical tables of lasting values.

Unless you are willing to reconsider the data availability policy which you state in Sect. 5, I will therefore be unable to consider your manuscript for publication.

With best regards,

Thierry Forveille
A&A Editor-in-Chief

From editorial.office@aanda.org Mon Jan 27 09:49:06 2025
Date: Mon, 27 Jan 2025 10:48:58 +0100
From: "Astronomy and Astrophysics (A&A)" <editorial.office@aanda.org>
To: petr.harmanec@matfyz.cuni.cz
Subject: aa53206-24:
Resent-From: <petr.harmanec@matfyz.cuni.cz>

Article reference: aa53206-24

<https://nestor.aanda.org/aa/user/article/aa53206-24>

Title: Half a century of photometry at Hvar I. Overview and emission-line stars

Author(s): H. Božić, P. Harmanec, J. Horn, K. Juza, P. Koubský, S.

Křiž, P. Mayer, P. Hadrava, D. Ruždjak, D. Sudar, S., Štefl, M.

Wolf, P. Zasche, M. Brož, J. Havelka, J. Honsa, V. Kocourek, M. Tlamicha, F., Z

d'arský, A. Harmanec, J. Jonák, A. Oplis, I. Piantšich, I.

Skokić, J., Švrcková, K. Vitovský, D. Vršnak, M. Zummer

Dear Prof. Harmanec,

I apologize for my delayed reply to your last mail, which was due to an extremely busy week.

The referee search did not start when you resubmitted due to a misunderstanding between the associate editor in charge of your manuscript and myself, but it is now going on.

The message which you received on our policy change is completely unrelated to the status of your manuscript (expect perhaps for the manuscript existing at all), as it was sent to all corresponding authors of A&A articles submitted within the last few years. Papers submitted before April 2nd, therefore including yours, are unaffected. I do note, though, that we already have a policy of charging authors for pages in excess of 30

<https://www.aanda.org/for-authors/author-information/page-charges> This will apply to your manuscript unless you'll agree to move its appendices to e.g. Zenodo.

With my best regards, and again my apologies for the delay,

Thierry Forveille
A&A Editor-in-Chief

31/01/2025 11:35

From: rubina.kotak@utu.fi

To: petr.harmanec@matfyz.cuni.cz

aa53206-24 : Referee report

Article reference: aa53206-24

Title: Half a century of photometry at Hvar I. Overview and emission-line stars

Author(s): H. Božić, P. Harmanec, J. Horn, K. Juza, P. Koubský,

S. Křiž, P. Mayer, P. Hadrava, D. Ruždjak, D. Sudar, S., Štefl,

M. Wolf, P. Zasche, M. Brož, J. Havelka, J. Honsa, V. Kocourek, M. Tlamicha,

F. Zd'arský, A. Harmanec, J. Jonák, A. Oplis, I. Piantšich,

I. Skokić, J. Švrcková, K. Vitovský, D. Vršnak, M. Zummer

Dear Petr,

Your manuscript was submitted to a referee, Dr. Dietrich Baade, who recommends publication, but only following fairly significant revision (report link appended below).

The referee is generally positive about the paper, but raises some valid concerns. Please take all points into account when revising the manuscript. When you have done so, upload the revised version to the A&A database using the following link:

<http://nestor.aanda.org/aa/user/article/aa53206-24>

The editor-in-Chief and I have discussed the two major points raised by the referee regarding the content of the introduction and table 4.

We agree with the referee that a more scientifically grounded introduction would be appropriate and that tabular information related to photoelectric photometry should be made available via e.g. zenodo, rather than in the main text of the article. The A&A office can provide more information on liaising with zenodo later in the process.

Do note that the nominal timescale for resubmission is within 3 months of receiving this first report, unless agreed otherwise with me.

Please indicate all changes in either colour or boldface in the next version, and also include a point-by-point response to each of the referee's comments in your cover letter. However, please note that your source files should only include the "clean" revised version. A separate pdf with the marked changes (bold or diff file) should be uploaded as an "optional file."

I look forward to receiving the revised version.

best wishes,
Rubina

Dr. Rubina Kotak
A&A Associate Editor

=====

Referee report(s) on this version:

Report by referee 1:

Download attached file

Please see uploaded file.

=====

Before resubmitting your manuscript, please take the time to verify the following common language and formatting issues.

- 1) Please note the spelling convention (US or UK) of your paper and run a spell check specific to your preference (see the A&A language guide for authors, Sect. 2.1, for common spelling and punctuation differences between these two conventions).
- 2) Check that abbreviations and acronyms are introduced correctly (see Sect. 5.2.4).
- 3) Check your reference format (see Sect. 3.6.2).

The A&A language guide for authors is available at
<https://www.aanda.org/for-authors/language-editing/1-introduction>.

For general information on publishing with A&A, please see the A&A author's guide, available at
<https://www.aanda.org/for-authors/author-information/paper-organization>.